BOOK REVIEWS


Reviewed by David Miller, Lecturer, Department of History, University of San Diego.

Few names in the history of California are more widely renowned than that of John Sutter (1803 – 1880). A Swiss immigrant who arrived on the North American frontier in the 1830s, Sutter’s life intersected many significant moments, places, and people in the West. With permission from Mexican authorities he founded the well-fortified agricultural and trading colony New Helvetia in California’s Sacramento Valley in 1840. This put him center stage to witness, and to shape, many events important to the development of both the West and the nation, including the doomed Donner expedition, the Bear Flag revolt, the United States conquest of California, the Gold Rush, and California’s entrance into the Union. By the time of his death many Americans knew him as the savior and gracious host of many weary immigrants. The distinguished explorer John Frémont spoke on behalf of the Associated Pioneers of the Territorial Days of California at Sutter’s funeral, recalling a great pioneer who carved an empire out of the wilderness, a leader to whom the nation remained indebted. Sutter was the man who made California.

Albert Hurtado reveals a much more complicated, troubled figure who in many ways gained renown in spite of himself. While Sutter’s life did touch many important moments in California history, he was far from the heroic settler of popular memory. His personal habits were at times ugly. He was addicted to the bottle, gullible, self-promoting, delusional, a philanderer, lacking good business sense, and perpetually in debt. Yet Sutter was at the same time gracious, well mannered, and amiable. He occasionally made poor choices that led to his downfall when better decisions would have brought with them much more financial security and personal well being. In this way Hurtado seems to suggest that history is still very much shaped by the choices individuals make. While much of western historiography revolves around the debate of the West as process versus the West as region, Hurtado reminds us that the West also included fallible people.

Hurtado’s portrait of Sutter and the world he lived in also demonstrates the contradictions and ambiguities of American empire. The conquerors succeeded only at great expense to many people. “It is important to understand,” Hurtado concludes, “that the national triumphs of the nineteenth century caused dreadful human suffering, that benefits to some meant costs to others” (p. 346). One example is the issue of labor in the West. Hurtado shows that Indian labor made Sutter’s (and many other westerners’) success possible. Sutter simply could not have managed to run New Helvetia without a tractable labor force. To that end he used many strategies to control Indian labor, ranging from gifts and wages to
discipline, debt, and military violence.

This portrait of Sutter is a welcome addition to the biographies of the West and Hurtado succeeds in his efforts to expose the nuances of a complex and troubled man. More importantly, Hurtado’s efforts to speak to the broader currents of Western history are just as successful. Hurtado demonstrates his mastery of the potential for biography to highlight the connections among individuals, institutions, culture, and myth. He joins a growing list of accomplished western historians such as Howard Lamar (Charlie Siringo’s West: An Interpretive Biography (Albuquerque, NM, 2005)), who are using the fascinating lives of westerners to spotlight broader historical events and processes. Using a personal narrative to illuminate historic change is not a new methodology, but Hurtado demonstrates that in the right hands it still holds many promises. Readers will appreciate Hurtado’s ability to reveal the intricate relationship between individuals, place, and process in the West.


Reviewed by Barry Alan Joyce, Associate Professor of History, University of Delaware.

King of the 40th Parallel: Discovery in the American West is at once a biography of Clarence King and a window into the origins of post-Civil War scientific exploration of the American West. Author James Gregory Moore, Senior Research Geologist Emeritus with the U.S. Geological Survey, writes as an “insider,” a latter-day kindred spirit who has literally trod the same western terrain in the name of science as did King and his cohorts. Moore relies on letters, journals, and government records to map out the mercurial life and career of the remarkable King, whose accomplishments set the standard for the systematic and comprehensive surveying of the American West.

The author follows the trail of this native New Englander from his early youth to his days at Yale, where he became enthralled with the idea of melding science and exploration while under the tutelage of James Dwight Dana, one of the scientists from the United States Exploring Expedition of 1838-42. At Yale King forged a close, life-long friendship with future western topographer James Gardner. In classic western fashion, King and Gardner eschewed a prolonged academic training in the East for the lure of western adventure and discovery. These fresh-faced college boys crossed the continent and found employment with the California State Geological Survey.

Within a few short years, King, still in his twenties, had parlayed his experiences into directorship of the most extensive and ambitious scientific survey of its time – the Geological Exploration of the 40th parallel. This Army-sponsored survey, begun in the late 1860s, cut a 100-mile swath west to east across the western landscape from the Sierras to Wyoming. It generated a wealth of scientific and topographical data and reports on a heretofore unstudied section
of the nation. The demands of this project inspired the participants to develop innovative research techniques and methods of reporting that set the standard for all subsequent surveys of the American West. King’s professional career peaked in 1879 when he was named the first director of the United States Geological Survey. King of the 40th Parallel brings to life those heady days when the seemingly unspoiled American West promised to reveal the deepest secrets of antiquity – in the form of geologic strata, glaciation, volcanism, fossils, and, perhaps most telling, precious metals – to those rugged, intrepid scientifiques willing to brave its harsh environments. This initial, “unspoiled” era of western science was surprisingly brief. By the late 1870s, expeditions funded by various public and private institutions were literally bumping into each other throughout the West in overlapping efforts – mapping the mapped, discovering the discovered. This redundancy predicated the creation of the United States Geological Survey in 1879. King’s life and career personified this era – exciting, intense, fruitful and brief. King flamed out by the age of forty, resigning the directorship of the USGS in 1881 after less than two years on the job. Always the entrepreneur, King spent the remainder of his life pursuing private endeavors in an unsuccessful attempt to become rich by exploiting his knowledge of the geology and precious metals of the West.

But there is more to Clarence King than this chronology suggests. King of the 40th Parallel captures the essence of King’s personality. For all of King’s academic training and acquired skills, his greatest attributes were his curiosity and imagination, his love of adventure, and especially his cognizance of the inherent beauty in nature. Such traits occasionally put him at odds with fellow scientists in the field who may have grown frustrated with his seemingly endless search for the perfect panorama. For instance, paleontologist William Gabb preferred King to spend less time admiring the view and more time helping him hunt for fossils (p. 73). Others frowned upon King’s prosaic field reports colored by an obsession with the nineteenth-century Ruskin School of Art.

But everyone loved his stories. According to Moore, all who came into King’s presence were invariably captivated by his gift for spinning a yarn. He was an inveterate storyteller who enlivened and brightened any gathering, and he parlayed this talent into his popular 1871 adventure narrative, Mountaineering in the Sierra Nevada, a work that gained him celebrity status in the 1870s as the beau ideal of the romantic, hardy scientist/explorer. It is in this work that King’s “sensitivity and his genuine interest in all humankind” shines most brightly, and is what sets him apart from the typical “academic” of his era (p. 224).

Moore himself seems to submit to the magic of King’s narratives and self-described adventures. Despite an occasional caveat that King “was not averse to embellishing his facts for the sake of excitement” (p. 61), Moore makes little attempt to substantiate King’s stories with alternative sources. Does it matter? If the author’s ultimate intent is to conjure the essence and spirit of this remarkable man, then it probably does not, although it would have been reassuring if at least a few of King’s adventures chasing bears, fighting Indians, and dodging bullets at point-blank range could have been corroborated through a companion account. Ultimately, one is left to hope that King was able to draw effectively the line between his tales of adventure and his scientific reporting.

Reviewed by Chuck Gunderson, Independent Scholar, Temecula, CA.

Much has been researched and written about the Mormon Battalion and its contribution to the Mexican-American War (1846-1848). Sherman L. Fleek, however, draws upon his experience as a colonel in the United States Army and military historian to provide a fresh perspective on the Battalion's history. Military historians have typically ignored the Battalion and their efforts since they did not engage in a single battle during their march, but Colonel Fleek wishes to establish that despite a lack battlefield experience, the Battalion served with honor and distinction, completed their enlistment with few deserters, and ought to be respected as a regular army unit.

This is indeed a noteworthy and valuable text, especially in the author's utilization of new source materials previously unavailable to scholars of Battalion history. Fleek also draws upon his own decorated career to discuss protocol and retrace the Battalion's steps. Furthermore, his military experience helps Fleek expose the Mormons' feelings towards their service to the United States forces. Fleek does especially well to reveal Mormon soldiers' fortitude and commitment despite expressions of hostility from gentile fellow citizens.

History May Be Searched In Vain demonstrates the unique history of the Mormon Battalion—the only unit in American military history that was recruited from one religious body and was mustered into federal service with a religious designation. Also unique is that it was the Mormon's religious leader, Brigham Young, and not military authorities, who made the call for the men to enlist. The time-honored military tradition of the men electing their leaders was also usurped by the Mormon prophet Young as he chose his own leaders. Young even allowed some women and children to march alongside their husbands, another unique occurrence in the annals of American military history.

Colonel Fleek writes a complete and accurate account of the reasons for Mormon enlistment, including the desire to save the Church from financial ruin, as they became part of General Stephen W. Kearny's Army of the West. The Battalion's experiences are well chronicled by Colonel Fleek through his use of a variety of primary sources that detail the soldiers' long westward march to the Pacific. For example, passages of the recently unearthed journal of Dr. George B. Sanderson, a volunteer assistant surgeon who traveled with the Battalion and whom the Mormon soldiers fittingly named “Dr. Death,” are included in this work. Dr. Sanderson's journal is most descriptive in recounting the hardships the Battalion endured in crossing burning deserts and harsh wilderness and surviving on scant food and water.

Colonel Fleek has also expertly researched and debunked a myth that both the Mormon Church and other noted historians have perpetuated for over a century: that the Battalion's trek of 1,950 miles constituted the longest infantry march in United States military history. One of the Battalion members, Sergeant Daniel Tyler, wrote that the "crowning achievement of the Battalion was carving
a great national highway across the desert,” to which Colonel Philip St. George Cooke, a career officer who accompanied the Battalion, responded, “History may be searched in vain for an equal march of infantry” (p. 317). Colonel Fleek rightly bestows the honor of the longest infantry march on the 6th U.S. Infantry. This unit in 1858 marched eight companies of men from Fort Leavenworth to Fort Bridger to assist, ironically, in the Utah War to quell a supposed Mormon uprising. Upon arrival at Fort Bridger, this division of soldiers was then reassigned to continue their march to the Pacific and completed a distance of 2,200 miles, thus surpassing the march of the Mormon Battalion.

*History May be Searched in Vain* is a valuable addition to the collected works of the history of the Mormon Battalion. Especially informative is Colonel Fleek’s recounting of time-honored military terms, traditions, and customs that existed in the Battalion. The work serves as a valuable resource to students and scholars of the American West.


Reviewed by Lauren E. Cole, Ph.D. candidate, Department of History, University of California, San Diego.

“The story of the Chinese in America,” this volume’s editors assert, “has been curiously told” (p. xv). They point out that narratives of American history have largely neglected Chinese and Chinese American experiences, or have been told without reference to Chinese American perspectives. And it is such storytelling that distinguished historians Judy Yung, Gordon Chang, and Him Mark Lai amend with this impressive anthology. Culled from their personal collections and newly-mined sources, *Chinese American Voices: From the Gold Rush to the Present* took more than a decade to compile. Many of the interviews, poems, speeches, songs, and letters that appear alongside newspaper articles and personal reminiscences have seen limited publication or appear here in English translation for the first time. Non-specialists will appreciate the introductions that preface each section of this volume and every document. Judicious footnotes provide additional useful information and interesting tidbits.

*Chinese American Voices* is divided into three chronological parts, the first spanning the 1850s through the end of the nineteenth century. Norman Asing’s 1852 critique of the Chinese exclusion movement in California and a report written by survivors of a deadly 1885 riot perpetrated against Chinese miners in Wyoming may be familiar. Others may be less so, such as a Saum Song Bo’s letter questioning why Chinese immigrants should contribute money to build a pedestal for the Statue of Liberty since they faced exclusion and “insults, abuse, assaults, wrongs and injuries from which men of other nationalities are free” (p. 56). Similarly intriguing is Wen Bing Chung’s account of life as a college student in the United States, including his participation in a baseball game against a cocky Oakland,
California team in 1881. (The Chinese students “walloped” their opponents, thanks in part to their “twirler” who learned the fine art of pitching at Yale University (p. 35).) Finally, Elizabeth Wong’s account of a mui tsai (bond servant) reveals the circumstances of one woman’s migration to and life in Hawai’i in the early 1900s.

Part Two focuses on the turn of the century through the Second World War, charting the experiences of American-born generations and the ties between persons in the United States and China. Eddie Fung’s memoir of his time as a prisoner of war during World War II, for instance, reveals how Fung came to understand himself as both American and Chinese. The fluid nature of migration and the importance of transnational financial and social ties unfold in Chin Gee Hee’s 1911 letter to the Chinese Six Companies, seeking assistance for a railroad project in China. Similar themes are reflected in a report by the Chinese Women’s Association, which raised funds for war relief for China and provided social services for Chinese families in 1930s New York. And actress Anna May Wong’s account of life in Los Angeles and Europe in the interwar years contrasts markedly with Helen Hong Wong’s experiences as a detainee at Angel Island, a Midwestern merchant’s wife, a laundress, and a factory worker. Of particular note in this section is Liu Liangmo’s account of how in the 1940s Paul Robeson, drawing connections between the oppression suffered by African Americans in the United States and Chinese in China, helped popularize in America the song that became the national anthem of the People’s Republic of China (the “March of the Volunteers”).

The final and most extensive section, making up nearly half of the volume, spans World War II through the early twenty-first century. Themes evident earlier reappear here, including immigration, reflections on identity, assimilation, and race, and strategies for challenging inequality and discrimination. The relationship between global politics and U.S. migration policy emerges in accounts of a Chinese war bride’s suicide in 1948 and Binh Ha Hong’s essay about her family’s escape from Vietnam and resettlement in Oregon in the late 1970s. Scientist Hsue-shen Tsien’s efforts to return to China in the 1950s and Maurice Chuck’s semi-autobiographical story about the Confession Program speak to the wide-ranging effects of McCarthy-era anticommunism on families across the United States. Finally, several documents articulate the widely different experiences of Chinese and Chinese American identity. Stand-outs include Sheila Chin Morris’s biracial adolescence in Minnesota, Bonnie Lew’s reflections on growing up in Mississippi, Jeffrey Paul Chan’s 1970 interview with writer Frank Chin, and Kitty Tsui’s poetry about the intersection of race, gender, and sexuality.

These sixty-plus documents handsomely illustrate dominant themes in Chinese American history and complement recently published monographs on the subject. Despite the difficulty of doing so, the collection takes an important step towards reflecting the regional diversity of Chinese America. Some readers may wish the editors had turned a more analytical lens on the documents, but this in no way diminishes their thoughtful demonstration of the richness of Chinese/American storytelling. Chinese American Voices offers general audiences accessible and engrossing narratives and provides faculty committed to using primary sources in the classroom a wealth of excellent material.

Reviewed by Hung Cam Thai, Assistant Professor, Department of Sociology and Intercollegiate Department of Asian American Studies, Pomona College.

In chronicling the complex social history of an upper middle class family who traversed between China and the United States over three generations from the late nineteenth century to the 1970s, Haiming Liu makes a significant contribution to transnational historiography. Liu challenges us to rethink carefully traditional theories of immigrant adaptation and acculturation, and he pushes our analytical focus to questions of how and why the “community of origin” played a pivotal role in the early periods of Asian American immigration after the emigration process took place. The central point that comes across in this meticulously researched and clearly written book is that much of what we know about Asian American history, until very recently, has been about the “American” stories of Asian immigrants in the United States, rather than the “Asian” stories that persisted as immigrants entered the United States in the early waves of Asian American immigration. Therefore, Liu moves away from models of framing immigrants who go from rural to urban, traditional to modern, and immigrant to “American” by providing a lucid account that these binaries were certainly blurry as the logics of transnationalism existed well before scholars wrote about them in the last two decades.

The historical evidence from the book is extracted from over nine hundred letters and writings as well as from family documents of the Chang family from Kaiping County in the province of Guangdong, China. Liu also uses records that were recently released from the National Archives and Records Administration of the United States. The strength of this book is its emphasis on specific life histories of various members of the Chang family and on careful usage of archival data to tell the social history of this transnational family. The book traces the life of Sam Chang, the eldest son of Yitang Chang, who in 1900 left his children (including Sam) and wife in China to emigrate to Los Angeles in order to open an herbal shop for non-Asians. The first half of the book tells the stories of the origin of this family, how transnational processes took place, and the stories of the herbal shop as part of the larger pattern of immigrant self employment. The chapter on the history of the herbal shop provides a fascinating account of how white Americans adapted themselves to Asian therapy in what Liu calls an example of “reverse assimilation.”

The latter half of the book focuses on general issues of racial discrimination, adjustment in the United States (and in China after migration), the constant movement and traffic of letters, people, and ideas, and the little known pattern of “return migration” during this time. In 1910, Yitang married an American born Chinese woman because his first wife in China had died of illness in 1908. By 1915, Yitang sponsored Sam, his first son from this first wife, to come to the United States and take over an asparagus farm that Yitang had invested with money he made from the herbal shop. Sam, with the help of Yitang, also sponsored the immigration of his wife and several children to the United States. The last three
chapters of the book poignantly depict processes of self employment and how Sam's and Yitang's children (from the second marriage) viewed education as the key route to upward mobility in the United States. Yet, because of discrimination, some of the children returned to China for professional careers. For example, Yitang’s third and fourth sons from the second marriage earned medical degrees from American universities but could not find jobs. They therefore returned to China for their entire careers and only resettled in the United States upon retirement. One of Sam's sons earned a Ph.D. from Georgetown and returned to China to work as a diplomat, serving at one time at the Chinese embassy in Nicaragua. Liu convinces us that the Chang family had deep transnational practices as soon as Yitang arrived in the United States in 1900.

While the book focuses on one Chinese American family, it tells a much larger story about transnationalism in general, about race and ethnicity, and about gender relations, mobility, and self employment. I highly recommend this book for classes in Asian American history, race and ethnicity, immigration, transnationalism, and social inequality.


Reviewed by Allison Varzally, Assistant Professor of History, California State University, Fullerton.

This book continues the run of recently published works that positions Los Angeles as central to understanding twentieth-century United States despite or even because of the city's distinctive characteristics. *Popular Culture in the Age of White Flight* examines the “the spatial and racial reconfiguration of urban life in post-World War II Los Angeles” (p. xiii). Although the movement of white ethnics mobilized by racial prejudices and favorable federal policies out of central city districts is an often told story, *Popular Culture* adds an intriguing and important twist. It explores changes in mass cultural forms and socio-political ideals precipitated by this migration. Leaving behind the uncertainties and inconveniences of the modern industrial city where classes and races casually mixed, long established and newly minted whites sought out and found in suburbs a more comfortable, predictable, and segregated environment. Their preference for the orderly and homogenous over the unruly and heterogeneous remade the substance, aesthetics, and locations of popular culture. The book’s most original argument is that as suburbanites played and lived in spaces that reflected an appreciation for the private over the public, their political subjectivities shifted. They increasingly embraced the privatized, individualistic ethos of conservatism, rejecting the communal orientation of the New Deal.

Avila highlights different points on the city’s mass cultural map – film noir, Disneyland, Dodger Stadium, freeways – to explain the emergence of a white suburban identity. Two very successful genres of film in the late 1940s and 1950s, noir and science fiction, depicted the modern city, especially Los Angeles, as a
site of deterioration and decay, inhabited only by the most dangerous, depraved, and dark skinned. The implication of such damning depictions was that whites should remove themselves from and erect barriers against the “black city.” Avila continues his story in the “vanilla suburb” of Orange County, where the newly constructed Disneyland offered an escape for suburban residents. It celebrated and promoted exactly those values of consumerism, patriarchy, and patriotism that they esteemed. Yet thanks to an aggressive program of urban redevelopment, even the landscape of the center city was being remade according to suburban priorities. As part of the elite’s grand scheme to revive Los Angeles’s downtown, a fortress-like Dodger Stadium was built upon a hill surrounded by parking lots, accessible only by freeways. Stadium advocates saw the razing of the Chavez Ravine neighborhood, the forcible displacement of its working class Chicano residents, and the rejection of plans for public housing as well worth the realization of their vision. The substitution of freeways for an extensive network of streetcars further privatized and racialized the experiences and political perspectives of postwar Angelenos.

Overall, *Popular Culture in the Age of White Flight* makes a persuasive case for the reconfiguration of space and its corrosive effect on a vision of community that celebrates the diverse, the unpredictable, and the inclusive. In the epilogue Avila attempts to disguise his own dismay at the values expressed in the new political and spatial arrangement, asserting that “the point here is not so much to mourn the passing of an idealized New Deal order, which was fraught with its own internal tensions and contradictions” (p. 228), yet the rest of the book does little to portray the transition as something other than a devolution. His nostalgia for the gritty, busy streets of the pre-World War II city would be less conspicuous and problematic if he had spent more time exploring the ideas and actions of white suburbanites. Given that one of the book’s intentions is to consider “the cacophonous stories that constitute culture” (p. xiii) – something it does well when discussing resistance to the construction of Dodger Stadium and the expansion of freeways – the interests of suburban whites should be sketched out rather than assumed and simplified. Also, while *Popular Culture* details how Los Angeles’s inner city Mexican and African Americans participated in a conversation about space and politics, the voices of the multiracial city’s Asian Americans and minority suburbanites are surprisingly silent. A discussion of “yellow flight” or “brown flight” and even “black flight” may have blurred the line Avila draws between “Chocolate Cities” and “Vanilla Suburbs,” but it might have added yet another dimension to his fascinating sketch of the new urban order.

Reviewed by Molly McClain, Associate Professor, Department of History, University of San Diego.

This book highlights the architectural achievements of Wallace Cunningham, a modernist architect inspired by Frank Lloyd Wright. Eighteen case studies of his projects illustrate his ability to create structures that respond poetically and functionally to the western landscape. The book is not so much a retrospective as an introduction to the work of a practicing architect in San Diego.

Born into a working-class family in Buffalo, New York, Cunningham saw his first Frank Lloyd Wright house, the Darwin Martin House (1904-06), when he was twelve years old. He wrote, “I loved the way it took control of the property. The house was heavy and dark, but then these ribbons of light came through into the rooms, and some of the spaces…” (p. 17). After graduating from high school, he went to Chicago where he fell into a group of artists and intellectuals who owned and admired modernist houses. Patrons, including Frances Snow Moran and her sister Mary Snow, sponsored his education at the Chicago Academy of Fine Arts and a brief apprenticeship at Taliesin.

Cunningham came to San Diego in the late 1970s at the invitation of Moran’s daughter and son-in-law. Having purchased a 4.5 acre property in Rancho Santa Fe, they wanted a house that would fit into the bowl created by two canyon ravines. Cunningham designed and built “Wing House” (1979-82), where he sought to convey, in architecture, the ripples created in water when two stones are thrown into a pool. He did this by building two concrete block semi-circles that traced the geometry of the canyons before meeting in a vortex. According to the author, “the house derives meaning from the landscape, and the narrative of man’s integration with the landscape via architecture and dwelling” (p. 145).


Cunningham views himself as both an artist and an architect. He creates forms that, in his words, are “as sculptural as they are architectural.” His poetic impulse gives rise to geometric designs that express motion and metaphor. “Open up a structure to sky, landscape, and view,” he writes, “and the building becomes alive. Your soul has a place to enter” (p. 10). Like many formalists, he emphasizes the timeless beauty of eternal forms: the straight line, the sphere, the square, and the spiral. He uses light—shadows, reflections, and refracted light—to define and shape a structure. He occasionally celebrates architecture as pure form, without
function. For example, at the back of “Harmony,” he placed a lone, freestanding column “that had no purpose other than its own existence” (p. 145).

Author Joseph Giovannini adopts the nuanced language of the critic to describe Cunningham’s work and architectural philosophy. It is clear, however, that he is a fan. He places Cunningham among an illustrious group of twentieth-century architects, including Wright, Le Corbusier, Irving Gill, R. M. Schindler, Mies van der Rohe, Eero Saarinen, Frank Gehry, and John Lautner. At the same time, he emphasizes Cunningham’s originality, describing him as a self-educated architect with a highly individualistic practice. He notes that works such as Wing House offered “a highly original response and alternative to the polarizing Modernist-Postmodernist style wars” raging in the 1980s (p. 145).

*Materializing the Immaterial: The Architecture of Wallace Cunningham* is a beautifully illustrated and enthusiastic assessment of the work of a prominent San Diego architect. It is recommended to anyone interested in the built environment of Southern California.


Reviewed by Renee M. Laegreid, Assistant Professor of History, Hastings College.

Eva Maria Garrouette, whose previous works have focused on providing a Native perspective on the use of Indian images in popular culture, turns her attention to a controversial issue among Native American tribes today—determining who is, or is not, a “real” Indian. In *Real Indians: Identity and the Survival of Native Americans,* she presents a thoughtful discussion on the pros and cons of the most common means of determining “Indianness.” She argues that the inability of Native peoples to come to terms with this issue has profound consequences on both the personal and tribal level. More than just a philosophical discussion, Garrouette offers her theory, Radical Indigenism, in the hopes it will encourage a discussion among Native peoples to find a solution based on their own traditions.

The first four chapters cover the most common tests used to determine Indianness, moving from what may seem the most precise method, legal definitions, to blood quantum, cultural definitions, and self-identification. Her discussion of legal distinctions covers the bewildering array of definitions used by individual tribes. The federal government does not provide clear guidelines, either; Garrouette notes that “since the U.S. Constitution uses the word ‘Indian’ in two places but defines it nowhere, Congress has made its own definition on an ad hoc basis” (p. 16). While legal definitions do protect Native Americans who meet the criteria, she argues the rules admit some into the group who perhaps should not be there, and excludes others who, because of a legal technicality, are denied the right to participate as full members of their tribal community.

Blood quantum has not provided an easy solution, either. Garrouette delves
into the unsatisfying question—how much blood is enough? The issue of blood quantum among Native Americans, having to prove one has enough Native blood to belong, is contrasted to the “black rule,” where, historically, the smallest trace of black heritage instantly and irrevocably moved a person’s racial designation from “white” to “black.” Why is it, Garrouette asks, that Indians are under such pressure to prove their Indianess, when for other ethnic or racial groups their identity is either unquestioningly accepted, or imposed upon them?

An Osage grandfather remarked, “If I look at a person and he’s actin’ and he’s doin’ and he’s thinking in the direction of an Indian, then he’s an Indian, regardless” (p. 73). Using a cultural standard for determining Native identity, the third means test discussed, may work on a personal level, but Garrouette argues its difficulties when determining the identity of a tribe. Citing contemporary legal cases, she argues a tribe’s need to meet cultural standards of Indianness denies the reality of their need to adapt to changing circumstances over time, and leads toward a definition of Indianness that is stereotypical and static. The fourth standard, self-identification, is the most problematic. While self-identification holds the promise for Native people who find themselves excluded from tribal membership using the other methods, it also opens the door to non-Indian people appropriating Indian ceremonies and traditions for their own purposes. The difficulties of determining who is or is not Indian, Garrouette argues, rests on the means testing, which are based in non-Indian ways. Her solution, Radical Indigenism, calls for Native peoples to find their own answers based on their own traditions. Radical Indigenism “assumes that scholars can take philosophies of knowledge carried by indigenous peoples seriously,” and allow Native Americans to “reframe the questions we ask about Indianness and to guide our inquiries in different directions” (p. 10). Garrouette examines the kinship system to show how many of the painful and divisive effects of current means testing could be diminished or eliminated.

This is a thoughtful, well-written book that fits into the growing scholarship by Native Americans insisting on approaching Native issues on their own terms, based on their own traditions and values. Garrouette anticipates a negative response from the Academy; I suspect the academy—and lawyers—will not disappoint her, despite her well-reasoned arguments. Ostensibly written with a Native readership in mind, this book should be read by anyone interested in both the complexity of the Indianness question and current intellectual trends among Native scholars.
BOOK NOTES

*American Catholics and the Mexican Revolution, 1924-1936.* By Matthew A. Redinger. Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2005. Appendices, bibliography, notes, and index. xii + 260 pp. $45.00 cloth. $22.00 paper. This monograph explores the reaction of American Catholics to the anticlerical aspects of the Mexican Revolution and Constitution of 1917.


